

**RALEIGH TRANSIT AUTHORITY  
OCTOBER 11, 2012  
MINUTES**

The Raleigh Transit Authority met on Thursday, October 11, 2012 at 3:30 p.m. in the City Council Chamber, Room 201 of the Municipal Building, Raleigh, N. C., with the following present:

Chairman Joseph Springer, presiding  
Corey Branch  
Gerry Cohen  
Jason Horne  
Roger Kosak  
Regina Price  
Craig Ralph  
Les Seitz  
Jane Thurman  
Uel Whitsett

Staff present: David Eatman, Mike Kennon, Scott McClellan, Lindsay Pennell

Chairman Springer called the meeting to order with discussion and actions taken as shown:

**AGENDA – APPROVED AS PRESENTED**

No changes were made to the agenda; therefore, without objection the agenda was approved as presented.

**MINUTES – SEPTEMBER 13, 2012 – APPROVED AS PRESENTED**

Members received in their packets a copy of the September 13, 2012 minutes. Mr. Whitsett moved approval of the minutes as presented. His motion was seconded by Mr. Kosak, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

**PARKS AND RECREATION SYSTEM PLAN PRESENTATION – RECEIVED AS INFORMATION**

Mr. Eatman introduced Laura Greco and explained the Parks and Recreation Department is developing a new long range planning document called the “System Plan”. This is a 16-month comprehensive process that will shape the direction, development and delivery of the City’s parks and recreation services over the next 20 years. The System Plan is a supplement to the 2030 Comprehensive Plan for the City of Raleigh, which was updated and adopted by the Raleigh City Council in 2009. The 2030 Comprehensive Plan includes significant updates related to delivery of parks and recreation services. Multiple

elements of the Comprehensive Plan relate to the Parks and Recreation Department's mission for services and facilities. The System Plan further seeks to expand on those elements. A summary of the plan was included in the agenda packets. Mr. Eatman noted the Parks and Recreation Department is going to all City boards and commissions to present this plan.

Ms. Greco provided a PowerPoint presentation relating to the System Plan noting this plan will build on the City's Comprehensive Plan. The 2030 Vision Statement and Parks and Recreation's mission statement were read. The scope of the project was reviewed. Ms. Greco explained this project began in the summer of 2012 with the creation of a planning committee (PlanCo) consisting of community leaders representing different services of the Parks and Recreation Department. They are a consensus seeking group that will assist in guiding the development of the System Plan.

The City Council approved a contract awarding AECOM as the prime consultant for the plan. In addition to city staff, AECOM will be conducting a five part process as follows:

- Existing System Analysis – Fall/Winter 2012
- Needs and Priorities Assessment – Winter/Spring 2013
- Long Range Vision – Spring/Summer 2013
- Implementation/Action Plan – Fall/Winter 2013
- Parks and Recreation Master System Plan Document – Early 2014

Ms. Greco reviewed public involvement that will occur in order to understand the current state of the park system needs and desires of where and how the park system should grow. These opportunities include City Website and interactive online engagement, citywide and online surveys, focus groups, community visioning meetings and presentations to boards and commissions. The draft System Plan will be presented for public comment throughout the City at various locations. The presentations will also be given to the Parks, Recreation and Greenway Advisory Board, Raleigh CAC and City Council.

Mr. Eatman asked if accessibility to the facilities will be reviewed. Ms. Greco indicated the GIS model will factor in transit stops. Mr. Eatman indicated he would like for Parks and Recreation to use the newly adopted Short-Range Transit Plan and the newly adopted Wake County 2040 Transit Long-Range Plan noting they would be good resources to see where the transit network is planned in the future. Ms. Greco indicated as this proceeds, information learned along the way will be incorporated.

The report was received as information.

## **BROKERAGE MANAGEMENT – RECEIVED AS INFORMATION**

Chairman Springer indicated this has been studied for a long time and was happy to see it is coming to conclusion. Mr. Eatman introduced representatives from Veolia Transportation, Inc. who provided a presentation outlining proven “best practices” in the

development and deployment of policies and technologies associated with a brokered ADA Paratransit network. Mr. Eatman explained the Authority authorized staff to move forward with the RFP for this service in the summer and staff has been working on developing the RFP, looking at options, technologies and best practices around the nation. He noted DOA Transportation manages CAT and has a lot of knowledge regarding provision of taxi based services throughout the nation. He reported Veolia representatives were present to provide an overview of available technologies and what they have personally accomplished. Mr. Eatman indicated this is conceptual but as we work through development of this proposal, development could go in many different directions. He stated this is a presentation to give an overview of how he thinks this should generally proceed.

Scott McClellan introduced members of the DOA team – Mike Yates, Brittany McMillan and Ron Brooks. Mr. Brooks, Vice-President for Paratransit and IntelliRide Development for Veolia Transportation, provided the presentation that included advantages and challenges of mixed-mode and taxi-based paratransit; summary of Veolia’s experience managing mixed-mode and taxi-based service; identification of strategies for managing safety, accountability, service quality and service cost and ideas for ensuring service quality and efficiency for Raleigh. Mr. Brooks reviewed Veolia’s Paratransit Portfolio noting they have a lot of experience managing taxi services. They have experience in every aspect of paratransit planning, management and operation. He reviewed their systems in San Francisco and Orange County, California including years of service, number of vehicles and trips per day, number of vehicles, responsibilities and relevance to Raleigh. Mr. Brooks then reviewed suggested strategies for managing mixed-mode service in Raleigh as follows:

- Supplement Raleigh’s call center to allow for all of the following:
  - Acceptance of reservations and scheduling of trips
  - Assignment of trips to participating van provider & taxi companies
  - Acceptance of same-day service calls including trip cancellations and “where’s my ride” calls
  - Acceptance and resolution of customer complaints
  - Monitoring of all service using standardized performance metrics
  - Use of IntelliRide to manage quality and cost of taxi services

Discussion followed regarding IntelliRide that is a hybrid approach for paratransit combining the productivity of traditional dedicated services with the cost efficiency of existing community vehicle-for-hire resources brought together through technology to create a single, seamless system. This results in service that is efficient, cost effective and customer-centric. How IntelliRide works was reviewed with Mr. Brooks noting a tablet/phone is provided to drivers. This results in giving real time monitoring and consistent data. The technology for communication with the taxi was reviewed. Benefits of IntelliRide for Raleigh were reviewed that included putting taxi-based service on par with van-based service, allows for consistent data and reports for all trips – regardless of mode and ensures accountability for service. Mr. Brooks reviewed financial considerations that included costs for a call center and IntelliRidge technology. There

would be a 120-150 day implementation involved for hiring and training, development of policies and acquisition, installation, configuration and testing of technology.

Mr. Eatman indicated currently we are doing between 250-300 trips per day on the shared ride system and are seeing an approximate \$80,000 savings. He noted staff knows there are additional savings out there. He indicated it is known that taxis have a permanent place in paratransit and a better way to manage resources is needed. In response to a question from Ms. Thurman, Mr. Eatman stated there is no way to track what happens between the time the trip leaves and comes back. He explained Trapeze is the largest software provider for paratransit in the United States and that is what we use. The trips are tracked and they generate mileage and we know what the charge should be generally but that is the only contact we have. There is no dispatching or control of trips once they leave and no way of verifying if the trip was taken. Mr. Ralph indicated IntelliRide would bridge the gap between what we have and IntelliRide. He indicated this was an excellent and informative presentation. In response to questions from Mr. Seitz, Mr. Brooks reviewed the services provided in San Francisco. In response to a question from Mr. Seitz, Mr. Eatman indicated no purchasing of rolling stock would be required. Mr. Brooks indicated the only thing purchased would be servers and hardware.

Mr. Kosak questioned driver certification with Mr. Brooks explaining certification of drivers varies. From Veolia's standpoint, the drivers need to be trained to provide the kind of passenger assistance people with disabilities need. How to fund this type of system was discussed with Mr. Ralph questioning whether this will be saving money by spending money. Mr. Eatman replied this would be the case and as this goes out for RFP, there will be a better feel of costs. He noted staff has a general idea of savings to be gained just by things staff has determined by using the shared ride system. He felt this can be replicated throughout the taxi portion as well.

Mr. Brooks spoke to the need to watch out for cost avoidance noting as the population ages, people that are not disabled and not used to using paratransit and are used to driving cars will be more amenable to taxi service as they get older. Mr. Eatman noted the fixed route system has seen double digit growth since 2009. He noted the only way to respond to increased demand for paratransit is with increased services and we will be hit directly with those costs. Discussion followed regarding use of debit cards that patrons could swipe. Mr. Brooks indicated debit cards could enhance from a service quality and data standpoint but is not recommended for this system. Raleigh is looking for a system where you can manage quality of service and accounting for service from a call center dispatch environment and that does not require the debit card system. Mr. Eatman explained the tablets work just like our van system and when the patron comes on board, the driver enters on board and uploads the odometer, then when the destination is reached, that is punched in. Mr. Seitz stated the debit card would save us resources noting users would be able to charge their cards. Currently we are paying for trips for people to come to City Hall to purchase tickets which is not something you would want to have to do. In regard to the call center, Mr. Seitz stated in Chicago and Charlotte, the call centers are open only as long as the service is being provided. He stated it has been mentioned we might go towards a 24 hour call system. He questioned what Orange

County, California used. Mr. Brooks responded typically call centers are open during the hours of service. Some systems that are not running 24/7 call centers use IVR when the centers are closed so you will have the center staffed during certain hours for reservations with live staff and have dispatchers on duty when services are available and technology to do routine things. Orange County operates during service hours only.

Mr. Eatman stated staff wanted to provide examples of what we are going to be doing and there will be a lot of interest as this moves forward. He noted later in the agenda he would discuss the BED Committee and City Council regarding this presentation and the next steps would be provided at that time.

In response to a question from Mr. Horne, Mr. Eatman indicated trips with ART can be booked with email now and this technology would also have IVR so patrons could learn when the vehicle will arrive and most importantly answer the much asked question of whether trips for the next day are booked. This would allow patrons to go online to determine if their trips is booked rather than call. Mr. Brooks stated some things cannot be resolved by computer and some staff will always be needed. Mr. Kosak stated people do not like IVR systems but a lot can be done with them and can make a very effective system, particularly in off hours.

This report was received as information.

#### **FINANCE COMMITTEE REPORT – RECEIVED**

Mr. Kosak reported the Finance Committee met on Thursday, September 6, 2012. The No Smoking Policy at MSS is still being reviewed by the City Attorney.

Mr. Kosak indicated the ART Contract Policies was discussed and is something Mr. Eatman brought up with the BED Committee. Mr. Eatman referred to the memo included in the agenda packets discussed at the BED Committee. He reported staff and management representatives from MV Transportation met with the Raleigh Mayor's Committee for Persons with Disabilities on September 12. James Benton, Chairman of the Committee, facilitated the meeting and key areas of concern were discussed and corresponding action items were developed. Action items included sensitivity training, centralized phone numbers, providing more specific pickup times for clients and ADA Program education and outreach.

In regard to sensitivity training, Mr. Eatman indicated MV Transportation now provides 40 hours of disability awareness and ADA training for all new employees and quarterly training for existing employees is also provided. The Mayor's Committee requested enlisting the assistance of a local disability awareness professional to supplement the existing training program. Staff and MV Management encourage the additional disability awareness training and use of a local trainer will provide additional training opportunities and promote continued communication between MV Transportation and the ADA clients served.

In regard to the centralized phone number, it was noted several concerns were raised relating to inability to reach transit staff before or after normal business hours and clients could not contact MV employees to inquire about the status of their pending trip. A centralized number was requested for normal operating hours and this contact number/dispatch office will act as the liaison between the 40 vendors and the assigned ADA clients. Mr. Eatman indicated staff is in favor of the change but additional financial resources are required. Savings currently seen within the ART program due to use of shared ride services could possibly support this initiative. He pointed out centralized dispatch may not be welcomed by all clients since it is an additional change and clients in some cases have developed relationships with vendors and are used to contacting them directly for any trip changes and questions. Mr. Eatman supported the change due to the increased ability to detect unauthorized trips, cancellations and no-shows.

Provision of more specific pickup times was discussed with Mr. Eatman explaining the current system has a thirty minute window to schedule all client pickups. During the meeting it was requested that CAT provide specific pickup times as provided by other providers in the region. Staff concluded this option cannot be implemented immediately due to the use of over 40 vendors and the mix of shared ride and taxi trips but this can be accomplished when the centralized number/dispatch center is created. This could be accomplished if formal contracts and supporting technologies were installed in all vehicles used by the ART program resulting in direct management and oversight of all taxi and shared ride related trips. Mr. Eatman indicated staff is excited about the potential savings and increased oversight these changes could bring to the ART program.

ADA Program education and outreach was discussed with Mr. Eatman reporting all parties agreed that continued dialogue will be critical to the success of existing and future ADA transportation initiatives. Staff will be attending a series of meetings with stakeholders to provide information on program requirements and to receive direct input from clients regarding program issues and concerns. The first meeting will be held October 10, 2012 at the Raleigh Lions Clinic for the Blind. Staff will further conduct question and answer interviews in forums accessible to persons with disabilities. These interview opportunities include the Raleigh Television Network, Triangle Radio Reading Service and other local public service broadcasts.

Mr. Eatman reported the BED Committee requested that staff come back to them in no less than 6 months with cost for implementing the call center. Staff will be developing an RFP or some type of Request for Information to price this out in a budget. This will have to be done quickly since the City's budget for the upcoming year begins this month. This information will be provided to the Authority.

Mr. Kosak questioned if a Finance Committee meeting will be needed this month. Mr. Eatman responded there will be a Retreat on October 30; therefore, all committee meetings in October will be cancelled.

## **MARKETING COMMITTEE REPORT – RECEIVED**

Ms. Thurman reported the Marketing Committee met on Friday, September 21, 2012 and advised members the Authority has adopted a shelter location (R16 Stop @ Blount Street Deck). This is a new stop and once it is up and running, the committee will come up with a schedule for the Authority on adopting that shelter.

The item relating to the bus paint scheme was discussed and is pending in the Marketing Committee. Mr. Eatman stated this goes back to development of the regional RFP working with Triangle Transit and other transportation providers. He noted other partners have been hesitant on working towards a unified paint scheme. As information becomes available on this, he would advise the Authority. Staff will be communicating with Triangle Transit in the near future. He noted advance of the proposed paint scheme has been put on hold by the Council. Mr. Seitz stated if the Council directs something different, the Authority would have to defer to the Council. Mr. Kennon indicated art work comes through the Authority. Mr. Kosak questioned the cost to take a bus from one paint scheme to another and the cost for the current paint scheme. Mr. Kosak stated at some point in time, depending upon the busses we get in, he was not sure it is economically smart to wrap them with Art-on-the-Move. Mr. Kennon indicated we are only talking about 2 new busses in the next 12 months. Mr. Eatman indicated more busses will be put on order but will not be received in the next 12 months. He noted the new paint scheme costs \$2,500 - \$3,000 per bus and the current scheme costs \$3,000 - \$5,000.

Ms. Thurman indicated the CAT Website is still a work in progress. Mr. Kosak questioned if the Authority would be voting for an overall website with Triangle Transit, DATA and us with Mr. Kennon responding that was one of staff's recommendations but there is no money budget this year and that will be a mid-term project.

Ms. Thurman reported Bus Shelter Advertising item is still pending in the Marketing Committee. She reported there have been 23 bus shelters adopted and bud advertising revenues for FY 2013 is \$44,600 which is a 48% increase compared to this time last year. In response to questions, Mr. Eatman reported there are 200 shelters in the system and 1,480 bus stops. Staff researched Charlotte's shelters and they had 260 shelters and more stops and indicated Raleigh is making good progress in shelters provision. Mr. Eatman reported there are 17 that should be let soon for construction and another 27 for development under the existing contract. A new RFP will be let for engineering design and construction management services in the next 3 months.

## **ROUTE COMMITTEE REPORT – RECEIVED**

Mr. Ralph reported the Route Committee did not meet. Mr. Eatman indicated the bus carry-on policy brochure is done and the policy is being used. He noted there are other pending policies for the Authority's review.

## **STAFF REPORTS – RECEIVED**

Members received in their agenda packets the following staff reports:

1. Statement of Income and Loss (August 2012)
2. Operating Statistics (August 2012)
3. Evaluation by Route (August 2012)
4. Ridership by Time of Day (August 2012)
5. Variance Analysis (August 2012)
6. Go PASS Ridership Summary (August 2012)
7. Go PASS Ridership by Agency (August 2012)
8. Accessible Raleigh Transportation Summary (August 2012)

Mr. Eatman reported total passengers is up 9% and this is without additional service hours. He noted when the route changes take place in January, there will be some flattening of ridership but will see productivity grow within 3-6 months. Mr. Branch requested highlighting routes that are going away in the future report.

The reports were received as information.

## **CONCLUDING REMARKS – RECEIVED**

Mr. Branch indicated it was great to be at the meeting and thanked staff for their work.

Mr. Ralph thanked staff for their work. For the upcoming retreat, he requested a handout of each staff member's responsibilities.

Ms. Thurman reported Try Transit Week was very successful and noted staff worked hard on this project. She indicated there should be a better way to get Authority members involved in some of these outreach items. She suggested that staff provide members with information on upcoming items in order to get volunteers to work with staff.

Mr. Seitz indicated the presentation relating to Brokerage Management was very enlightening. He indicated the membership roster provided to members does list staff members and their responsibilities.

Mr. Kosak thanked staff for the presentations at this meeting. He indicated this has been very challenging for the Authority over the last couple of years. He indicated he was quite serious about his statement on the VRT systems noting some very creative things have been done with them.

Mr. Cohen reported since the last meeting, the Union Station has been fully funded. He indicated assuming it is opening in 2015 and it is going to be a loop, he would question how it is being designed so busses can get through there successfully. He stressed the importance of design and wanted to be sure it is designed correctly. Mr. Eatman reported the RFP will be released for Moore Square soon (30-90 days) and it has been decided, as

part of that, to turn this into the Moore Square Renovation/Union Station Feasibility Study. He stated he did foresee a large portion of services moving toward Union Station. Mr. Branch questioned if Greyhound is involved with Mr. Eatman noting they have been in touch with staff and their intent is to move to the facility if they can work out an arrangement with the City Raleigh as that facility continues to evolve. He stated the Greyhound issue is on the table and they are interested in getting there. He indicated it will be a true multi-modal center and he viewed that as 1/5 or 1/6 of the overall center.

Mr. Cohen referred to the ridership report noting the State employee ridership continues to slide. Mr. Eatman indicated this is a result of the stiff enforcement and the requirement to show IDs.

Mr. Whitsett thank staff for their work

Mr. Horne thanked staff for their work and indicated the presentation provided today was excellent. He indicated he is intrigued about use of technology in improving services and efficiency and would be interested in learning more about that and advocating for that kind of thing.

Mr. McClellan noted the State Fair is coming up. He indicated CAT is down a couple of drivers but had people step up to be sure everything works smoothly. He stated he was looking forward to another good year of Fair transport.

#### **CHAIRMAN'S REPORT – RECEIVED**

Chairman Springer thanked staff for their work and was impressed with today's presentation.

He noted there will be a Retreat on October 30, 2012. Mr. Eatman reported there will be review of the work plan recently adopted noting it was developed quickly and did not discuss in detail prioritizations. He noted staff wants to receive new ideas and look at big idea types of issues. He noted the retreat is scheduled for 8:30 a.m. until 12 noon at the CAT Maintenance Facility and there will be a facilitator. He noted there will be enough items scheduled to take up the entire morning.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Brenda Hunt

